

Henry Irvine-Fortescue
Statement of Case and Proposal Details - June 2008

My name is Henry Irvine-Fortescue. Although I am a vice-chair of Road Sense, this statement of case is presented by me personally as owner of Kingcausie Estate, on which draft Compulsory Purchase Orders and Side Road Orders have been served.

As a statutory objector to the above, I wish to present evidence for consideration at the forthcoming public local inquiry.

This statement of case regards the identification of alternative routes, and alternative designs, including the location of junctions, for the AWPR. In order for my proposals to be properly considered at the inquiry, the proposals are described below. Two maps are attached in Appendix 1 and 2. A list of the documents to which I intend to refer is in Appendix 3.

My proposals are alternatives to the current proposed route, the Milltimber Brae route plus the Stonehaven fastlink. I have two proposals, each with three sub-options, identified as follows:-

1. Tunnelled Murtle Direct Link to A90

- 1.a Tunnelled Murtle Direct Link to A90 with tunnelling at Badentoy
- 1.b Murtle Direct Link to A90 with tunnelling at Badentoy
- 1.c Murtle Direct Link to A90

2. Tunnelled Murtle with Fastlink

- 2.a Tunnelled Murtle with Fastlink with tunnelling at Badentoy
- 2.b Murtle with Fastlink with tunnelling at Badentoy
- 2.c Murtle with Fastlink

My case will demonstrate that:-

- 1. These options are viable and deliverable;
- 2. Transport Scotland failed to identify, appraise and produce reports on these or similar options;

- 3. These options have the potential to be superior to the Milltimber Brae and Fastlink proposal in almost every respect. They will most certainly be shorter and less environmentally damaging;
- 4. The addition of the Stonehaven fastlink was decided very late on in the route selection process and other fastlink options were not considered in enough detail, if at all.

The Promoters accept that affected landowners are entitled to identify alternatives and that the existence of alternatives may form grounds of objection to a CPO. However, the nature of such alternatives would involve the identification of alternative sites for the proposed AWPR or associated junctions, which is what I propose to do in my evidence.

In the interests of saving time at the inquiry, I propose to concentrate mainly on the Tunnelled Murtle Direct Link to A90, option 1 above, and the Tunnelled Murtle with Fastlink, option 2 above. Passing reference will be made to the other options mentioned above, as appropriate, as well as potential A90 junctions to the south of Portlethen, at New Bourtreebush and Cammachmore, if these would be preferable in accordance with DMRB standards.

As regards costings, I reserve the right to discuss these in relation to the above options, on a comparative and specific basis, once the statement of baseline costs has been agreed by the parties.

Route proposals

All the alternative proposals above are based on the well-developed Murtle route, as described in the (undated) STAGI assessment. The main differences from the Murtle route are:-

Option 1

1. Tunnelled Murtle Direct Link to A90

This proposal is shown on the map at Appendix 1. The proposal is the continuous black line. The original Murtle route is amended. Instead of running west from Charleston, the route leaves the A90 further south at Portlethen, running westwards, then turning northwards to the west of the Hare Moss, where it links onto the original Murtle route. The section of the Murtle AWRP from Charleston to Hare Moss is deleted, and there is no separate fastlink. I am informed that the road, tunnels and junctions must be designed in accordance with the requirements of the DMRB and the properly forecast design year traffic flows making due allowance for the whole of the MTS, including Crossrail and increased fuel prices.

My current proposal is that the junction with the A90 is an at-grade roundabout located at the west end of Bruntland Road, Portlethen. The unclassified road going west to Berrytop and Lairhilllock is linked into this roundabout. The A90 junction of Bruntland Road must be designed in accordance with DMRB requirements.

It is conceivable that an at-grade roundabout would prove to be acceptable at the Bruntland Road junction. An at-grade roundabout is to be found at Murcar on the northern approach to Aberdeen and one is proposed at Craibstone on the A96.

The A90 traffic flows to the south of the Badentoy grade separated junction (GSI) are significantly less than those at Charleston and Marywell where a new GSI has recently been completed. In any event, the Bruntland Road junction is overdue for an up-grade, with or without the AWRP.

From the Bruntland Road junction on the A90, the road travels west through agricultural land south of Aquhorthies Farm, curving north to the east of Auchlee Farm. It skirts the western end of the Badentoy Industrial Estate passing between Redmire and Redmire Cottage before swinging in a north easterly direction to the east of Bishopston. It continues as the Murtle route thereafter.

The section of the Murtle route at Blairs is tunnelled under the River Dee SAC and Murtle/Camphill, emerging just north of the North Deeside Road. The southern entrance to the tunnel is to the east of Blairs College, and the northern exit is to the north of the North Deeside Road.

It is conceivable that the junction with the A93 North Deeside Road could be at-grade. The option of a GSI, either on line or off line with the A93, could be explored. The A93 junction must be designed in accordance with DMRB requirements.

1.a Tunnelled Murtle Direct Link to A90 with tunnelling at Badentoy

As 1 above, but with the addition of a tunnel under Cairnwell Hill, with the road going northwards under the Badentoy Industrial Estate, emerging to the north of the unclassified road at Schoolhill.

1.b Murtle Direct Link to A90 with tunnelling at Badentoy

As 1.a above, but without the tunnelling at Murtle.

1.c Murtie Direct Link to A90
As 1.c above, but without the tunnelling at Badentoy, and without the tunnel under the River Dee at Murtie.

Option 2

2. Tunnelled Murtie with Fastlink
This route is shown on the map at Appendix 1. This route is the original Murtie route, which comes west from Charleston, plus a fastlink. The fastlink follows the line from the A90 at Portlethen. This is shown as a continuous black line going north as far as Bishopston. From there the dotted line indicates the proposed road alignment to join with the Murtie route. The junction would be to the south west of the Hare Moss, to connect with the westward link from the A90 at Charleston. (This is a similar concept to the currently proposed Cleanhill junction.)

The details of the A90 junction are as in option 1. above. The proposal would be for the new roundabout, south west of the Hare Moss, to be at grade, and in accordance with DMRB standards.

The road would be tunneled under the River Dee and Murtie Camphill as in option 1.

2.a Tunnelled Murtie and Fastlink with tunnelling at Badentoy
As 2 above, but with a tunnel under Cairnwell Hill, with the road going northwards under the Badentoy Industrial Estate, emerging to the north of the unclassified road at Schoolhill.

2.b Murtie with Fastlink with tunnelling at Badentoy
As 2.a above, but without the tunnelling at Murtie.

2.c Murtie with Fastlink
As 2.b above, but without the tunnelling at Badentoy.

Appendix 1 and 2.
Map of Direct Link to A90 (black line)
Map of Fastlink (black line going south) combined with route to Charleston (dotted line)

Appendix 2 -- Options 1.a and 2.a

Map of option 1.a and 2.a, Direct Link to A90 with tunnelling at Badentoy.
Tunnel shown as dotted line.
Direct link shown as black line.

Map of option 2.a, Fastlink with tunnelling at Badentoy.
Tunnel shown as dotted line,
Fastlink shown as black line,
Route to Charleston shown as dotted line.

